



President and Provost's Council on Women

Subject: President and Provost's Council on Women (PPCW) 2018 Report

Date: January 31, 2018

From: Jacquelyn Meshelemiah, Chair
Amy Lahmers, Incoming Chair
Lisa Borelli, Past Chair

To: Dr. Michael Drake, President
Dr. Bruce McPheron, Executive Vice President and Provost

The PPCW's mission involves "advocating to the President and Provost for the advancement of all women at The Ohio State University and providing leadership for the development of policies and practices that positively affect the working environment for women employed at The Ohio State University." Each year, the Council is charged with examining issues that affect women and making recommendations in an End of Year Report. For the period of February 2017 to January 2018, the original charges were to examine flexible work; the Glass Breakers; and mentoring practices. These charges were examined by members on the Policy & Practice Task Force, Glass Breakers Task Force, and Mentoring Task Force, respectively. (See below.)

TASK FORCES

Policy & Practice Task Force: To inventory and collect data on OSU departments/units' flexible work practices; recognize units that demonstrate "flexible work" best practices.

Glass Breakers Task Force: To identify and honor women who: Currently serve as an OSU staff or faculty member at any level; demonstrate career progression within the University; work towards creating a workplace environment that is supportive of women and diversity; and expand their sphere of influence by mentoring junior professionals, participating in professional organizations, serving on search committees, or other examples of service and engagement. Additionally, the task force was charged with identifying a new owner to carry the Glass Breakers program forward.

Mentoring Task Force: To inventory and report best practices regarding mentoring initiatives for women staff and faculty at Ohio State; to report effective mentoring initiatives for women staff and faculty at benchmark institutions.

The following are brief End of Year Reports that uniformly include:

- Identification of task force members
- Charge of each task force
- Process/Activities
- Results/Findings
- Next Steps
- Recommendations

Appendices are included as separate documents. The Closing the Loop Report is also attached here as a standing report annually submitted at the end of each year. It is a collaborative report of the PPCW and The Women's Place.

The Chairs of the PPCW in collaboration with the Directors of The Women's Place, look forward to continuing the important service that the Council provides to the University. We plan to discuss our recommendations from these reports at our February 15th meeting with you. We look forward to your feedback on our reports. After our meeting, we will bring forward potential charges for your consideration as we transition into our next set of Chairs for 2018-2019.

Policy & Practice Task Force End of Year Report

1. TASK FORCE MEMBERS

Tiffany Quattlebaum, Chair	Fiscal Manager	Dept of Psychology, ASC
Alicia Bertone	Professor	College of Veterinary Medicine
Katherine Betts	Intercultural Specialist	Multicultural Center, Office of Student Life
Emily Caldwell	Media Relations Manager	Office of the President
Molly Driscoll	Mgr, Learning & Development	Office of Human Resources
Robert Perry	Professor & Vice Chair	Dept of Physics, ASC
Shannon Winnubst	Chair	Dept of Women's Gender/Sexuality Studies, ASC

2. CHARGE

- a. To inventory and collect data on OSU departments/units' flexible work practices; recognize units that demonstrate "flexible work" best practices.

3. PROCESS/ACTIVITIES

- a. After task force discussion and consideration and consultation with AVP of HR Admin and Operations Kim Shumate and Institutional Research and Planning contacts Julia Carpenter-Hubin and Jason Sullivan, we developed a survey to collect objective information from Senior HR Professionals (SHRP) about the implementation of the university's Flexible Work Policy in large units. The university will have an opportunity to collect additional data from employees on the policy's application in an upcoming culture survey. Legal Affairs representatives conducted a final review of the task force's questions before Kim Shumate disseminated the survey via email to 50 SHRPs between December 1-15, 2017.

4. RESULTS/FINDINGS

- a. Of the 50 SHRPs who received the survey, 15 completed the flexible work portion of the survey (30% response rate) from a variety of colleges and support units across the main and regional campuses. Departments within large colleges or support units were not directly solicited to complete the survey as typically the HR view of how policy is being used is handled at the Senior HR Professional level.
- b. **College of Public Health** reported between 26-50% of its staff are currently working a flexible schedule arrangement, while the other 14 respondents reported less than 25% of employees have a flexible work arrangement.
- c. Units reporting that 76-100% of requested flexible work arrangements were granted over the past 5 years include: Office of Business & Finance; Advancement; Glenn College; College of Food, Agricultural, and Environmental Sciences; and Fisher College of Business. College of Medicine reported approval of more than half of all flexible work arrangements requests over the past 5 years.
- d. Flex time (variation of M-F 8-5 schedule) is utilized in all 15 units, and remote work arrangements are in place in 14 responding units. Reduced/expanded FTE appointments occur within 12 units, and 10 units reported the use of customized, informal arrangements. Only 1 unit reported having a job sharing arrangement in place.
- e. Inflexibility of job duties was listed as the primary reason for denial of staff flexible work requests, followed by employee performance concerns and scheduling complications.
- f. Four units have documentation specifying how staff alternative scheduling arrangements are implemented, but only 2 of the 9 responding units that have faculty also document how an alternative schedule would be implemented for faculty.
- g. Five units requested additional training related to clarifying the policy: defining eligibility by position, evaluating requests, completing forms, establishing timelines, and communicating reasons for denials. One unit also specifically stated, "It would also require a cultural shift in that many managers still feel that staff

need to be physically present to do their work even though much work could be done through a flexible schedule and could also enhance work life balance.”

- h. Informal conversations with staff colleagues suggest that the Colleges of Engineering, Nursing, and Social Work foster a supportive culture for flexible work arrangements for staff. Within other units, the support varied and was largely dependent on leadership and management.

5. NEXT STEPS

- a. Submit questions to include in the upcoming staff culture survey related to flexible work practices and the corresponding effects; include questions about flexible work arrangements' effects on culture and job satisfaction if feasible.
- b. Begin a conversation with Dr. Kay Wolf in OAA about the potential to work with faculty and executive leadership on ways to curb a turnover problem in clinical disciplines and create options for flexible work policies to apply to clinical faculty positions.
- c. Redistribute this survey to SHRPs again in a year or biannually to monitor progress.

6. RECOMMENDATIONS

- a. Implement more effective OHR communication and training on the Flexible Work Policy that provides guidance on evaluating requests for Flexible Work Arrangements to Managers and unit HRPs.
- b. Request that unit HRPs communicate Flexible Work Policy to employees in a direct manner.
- c. Update HR website to make accessing the Flexible Work Policy and recommended forms more user-friendly. Highlight it under the benefits or wellness section so current and prospective employees can associate it as a benefit for working at OSU.
 - ~Add FAQ section for this policy to address concerns employees and managers may have when considering a Flexible Work Arrangement. University of Michigan and Harvard University have great resource websites related to Flexible Work Options that could serve as a model.
- d. Solicit nominations for supervisors to be recognized for promoting work-life balance and highlighting their best practices in OnCampus similar to the University of Michigan's "Work-Life Champions."
- e. Encourage leaders to market innovative Flexible Work options to potential employees. (OSU's Flexible Work Policy is strategically vague to allow for flexibility of units and managers in meeting their individual business needs. These options must be taken advantage of when feasible.)
- f. Consult with the Office of Human Resources on how best to meet the pending needs of OSU employees related to Flexible Work options given the changes that will result due to the implementation of new 2017 Strategic Plans. Assess HR's capacity to address the potential needs driven by these Plans.

Glass Breakers Task Force End of Year Report

1. Task Force Members

Jacque Aberegg (Chair)	Senior Director, Strategy	University Marketing
Sara Childers	Assistant Director, The Women's Place	Office of Diversity and Inclusion
Shelly Martin	Manager, Patient Transportation	Wexner Medical Center
Amy K. Lahmers	Program Director	Biomedical Sciences Graduate Program
Ansel Oakleaf	Resource Planning Analyst	Office of Institutional Research Planning
Emily Rider	HR Generalist	College of Pharmacy/ASFW Pres-elect
Hua Wang	Professor	Food Science and Technology
Ann-Marie La Bue	Ex-Officio Member	

2. Charge

2.1 To identify and honor women who:

- a) Currently serve as an OSU staff or faculty member at any level;
- b) Demonstrate career progression within the University;
- c) Work towards creating a workplace environment that is supportive of women and diversity; and
- d) Expand her sphere of influence by mentoring junior professionals, participating in professional organizations, serving on search committees, or other examples of service and engagement.

2.2 To identify a new owner to carry the Glass Breakers program forward.

3. Process/Activities

- a) In its fourth year, the program continues to gain momentum and awareness. Based on last year's overwhelming response to nominations, the nomination form was further streamlined to facilitate evaluation and comparison, as well as request nominations by groups.
- b) The taskforce evaluated each of the 27 nominations received against the established rubric. Six nominations (3 staff and 3 faculty) were selected, recommended, and forwarded to the PPCW Leadership. (See appendix 1 for recommended recipients).
- c) Concluded exploratory discussions with the Office of Human Resources (OHR) for Glass Breakers to become one of its staff and faculty recognition programs. OHR is the process of re-evaluating all recognition programs with the goal to streamline for efficiency and is not able to take on the Glass Breakers recognition program at this time.

4. Results/Findings

- a. Six award recipients (3 staff and 3 faculty) were recommended for 2018. (See Appendix 1.)

5. Next Steps

- a) Development of the Glass Breakers profiles and *OnCampus Today* announcement.
- b) Development of stories by University Marketing.

6. Recommendations

Given Glass Breakers' focus on stellar achievements of both staff and faculty women, the recommendation is for the program to be elevated to a university wide office so that it garners increased prestige. Specifically, it is recommended that the Office of Human Resources take on Glass Breakers. If this is not feasible due to capacity issues, it is recommended that the Office of Human Resources work jointly with the Wexner Medical Center's Faculty and Staff Recognition Office as co-collaborators. (See Appendix 2 for transition requirements.)

Mentoring Task Force End of Year Report

1. Task Force Members

Kristen Cole (Chair)	Senior Director of Operations	OSUCCC – James
Theresa Delgadillo	Professor	Comparative Studies
Wanda Dillard	Director, Community Development	OSUWMC
Tiyi Morris	Associate Professor	African American Studies
Binaya Subedi	Associate Professor	Education and Human Ecology

2. Charge

- a. To inventory and report best practices regarding mentoring initiatives for women staff and faculty at Ohio State
- b. To report effective mentoring initiatives for women staff and faculty at benchmark institutions

3. Process/Activities

- a. Inventory completed of mentoring resources and programs at Ohio State geared towards female faculty members across a majority of the colleges, schools and programs. (A.1)
- b. Surveyed senior HR leaders (N = 50) across the university to determine presence of best practices for staff mentoring within specific units. A total of 21 responses received. (A.2)
- c. Inventory completed of mentoring resources and programs geared to female faculty and staff at select universities. (Arizona State, Penn State, Illinois-Chicago, Illinois-Urbana Champaign, Maryland, Wisconsin) (A.3 to A.8)

4. Results/Findings

Identified Gaps in Mentoring Women at Ohio State

- a. Faculty mentoring: Few programs recognize differential mentoring needs of women and men. Other general gaps include development of junior faculty beyond initial promotion, and lack of written guidelines and publication of existing resources on department websites.
- b. Staff mentoring: Availability of mentoring programs and awareness of existing resources within HR are significant gaps for the 25,000 non-faculty university staff. One program in the Department of Athletics supports nine female coaches, but there are no other gender-specific program identified for the remaining 16,500 female employees at Ohio State.

Best Practices at Ohio State (faculty only)

- a. College of Medicine – Center for Faculty Advancement, Mentoring and Engagement (FAME) and Women in Medicine and Science Committee (WIMS). (A.9)
- b. Ohio State – ADVANCE. Created to increase the representation, advancement and recruitment of women faculty in academic STEMM careers and contribute to the development and success of global research leaders. (A .10)

Best Practices at Selected Universities

Faculty mentoring:

- University of Wisconsin – Women Faculty Mentoring Program, to support and retain women assistant professors through the tenure process. (A.11)
- University of Illinois (Chicago) – College of Dentistry Faculty Mentoring Program. Provides a menu of options for all faculty and includes a Women Faculty Peer Mentoring Group. (A.12)

Staff mentoring:

- Arizona State University: Commission on the Status of Women, Staff Mentoring and Development Program. This six-month program selectively accepts 40 participants each year and includes one-on-one mentoring, workshops and specific completion requirements. (A .13)
- Pennsylvania State University – Administrative Fellows Program, emphasizing women and minority candidates among faculty and staff. Developed jointly by the Office of the President and the Commission for Women. (A.14)

5. Next Steps

- a. Consult with Dr. Kay Wolf's office (and the 2018 Carole Anderson Faculty Fellow) on faculty mentoring issues. (A.15)

6. Recommendations

- a. Commission task force through University Senate to study faculty mentoring issues. (A.15).
- b. It is recommended that an Associate Professor to Professor mentoring program with emphasis on women and

- underrepresented minorities be considered. (A.16)
- c. Include mentoring as part of annual assessment of academic units and senior administrative leaders. (A.17)
 - d. Emphasize Time and Change strategic plan targets focused on talent management, such as "Develop a robust faculty, staff and leadership development program that inspires medical center talent to realize their full potential".
 - e. Consider a university wide staff mentoring program that is administered through the Office of Human Resources. The program should have components that are specific to women and ethnic/racial minorities.
 - f. Continue charge for FY19 to increase awareness, develop models and work with units as new mentoring initiatives unfold.

Closing the Loop End of Year Report

1) Task Force Members

Jennifer Beard	Director	The Women's Place
Lisa Borelli	Social Worker	Ohio State Employee Assistance Program; Outgoing PPCW Chair

2) Charge

2.1 During the 2012-2013 work years the PPCW instituted a standing task force entitled, "Closing the Loop" which is charged with the ongoing task of documenting and monitoring the recommendations of the PPCW's various task forces and initiatives. The activities of "Closing the Loop" task force are specified in the PPCW Operating Guidelines and each year will be chaired by the immediate past president of the PPCW. The task force continues to build a scorecard spreadsheet to track the movement of PPCW recommendations. This INTERIM report reflects the activities of the 2017-18 Calendar year toward tracing the recommendations of the PPCW.

Past PPCW Recommendation	Outcomes – Current, Ongoing and Future
<p>Change the male dominant culture by hiring more women leaders; provide learning opportunities to male leaders and middle management, and help leaders recognize women as leaders</p> <p><u>Senior Leader Partners</u> James Moore, ODI Susan Basso, OHR Alison Mincey, OHR Kay Wolf, OAA</p>	<p>Current</p> <p>All participants selected for the Big Ten Academic Alliance (formerly CIC) Leadership program are women</p> <p>Ongoing</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Recruitment and selection toolkit to be placed online as well as policy being updated. New policy increases requirement for best-practice training focusing on recruitment and selection to diversify faculty candidates by unit. Goal Autumn Semester 2016. Under assessment in consideration of the Workday implementation, which will result in modifications and enhancements to the current recruitment and selection process. This includes the policy framework in this space. • Increasing requirements for all faculty and executive-level search committee members to participate in implicit bias and hiring workshops prior to hiring. • Ohio State Advance offers multiple workshops and consultation providing learning opportunities. • OHR created a learning and development specialist position to focus on diversity & inclusion for administrative units. • The Women's Place and partners, with the support of Provost McPheron, have implemented the Advocate and Allies program, which focuses on transforming the climate of the institution by enhancing men's engagement in equity work. Twenty-one additional Advocates were oriented in Spring 2017. One hundred thirty-nine men in various units have participated in Allies workshops, conducted by the advocates, to date.

	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> David P. McQuaid, CEO, University Health System, COO Wexner Medical Center announced in October 2017 that 5 women would be advanced to senior executive positions in the hospitals. <p>Future</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> Applications to be online for all faculty hires. This will allow better analysis of hiring practices by unit and will assist in Affirmative Action goals and planning. This will occur once Workday is implemented. However, we have updated the Affirmative Action/EEO data collection tool to ensure that we are capturing appropriate data prior to the Workday implementation. This tool is not currently being utilized to the extent necessary to accomplish compliance and equity analysis goals.
<p>Add Office of Human Resources, Office of Diversity and Inclusion, and online course/training (CBL, Buckeye Learn) focused on understanding and avoiding gender bias.</p> <p><u>Senior Leader Partners</u> James Moore, ODI Susan Basso, OHR Alison Mincey, OHR Kay Wolf, OAA</p>	<p>Current</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> Transforming Workplace Culture: Identifying and Addressing Implicit Bias – Office of Human Resources - Two hour in-person workshop open to all employees. <p>Ongoing and Future</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> Online classes through Buckeye Learn – OHR and OAA in discussion regarding opportunities to include classes through Buckeye Learn. OHR, ODI & OAA are collaborating to implement The Buckeye Portal for Inclusive Excellence, a central repository of Ohio State activities, events, and programs that support the university’s efforts toward inclusive Excellence. It serves as an entry point for unit action planning and cataloging of these efforts and will provide opportunities for collaboration as well as serves as a foundation for identifying promising practices in inclusive excellence.
<p>Charge the Office of Human Resources to document salary data by gender to colleges. Incentivize colleges to address inequities in salary when males earn more than females in similar positions.</p> <p><u>Senior Leader Partners</u> James Moore, ODI Susan Basso, OHR Alison Mincey, OHR Kay Wolf, OAA</p>	<p>Current</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> Diversity Impact Analysis is now a component of each deans’ review. The Compensation and Classification project, including looking at career paths for staff, is continuing to be an area of focus for the Office of Human Resources. As important decisions are finalized and resources are approved the project will more rapidly move forward. The Ohio State University has joined the Columbus Women’s Commission to help dismantle barriers and reduce gender-based inequities to improve the economic position of women in Columbus.

	<p>Future</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Comparison of new hires by gender, rank, position, and unit to salary. Buckeye Portal for Inclusive Excellence to be launched early in Spring semester. • Dean's compensation correlates with D & I outcomes during annual reviews. • HR would like to discuss further the request for salary data comparisons as we have multiple job titles as well as ranges of duties within specific jobs (i.e. program coordinator) that make data comparisons on a gender basis difficult and misleading. • HR will continue to build out Affirmative Action goals and planning to ensure ongoing compliance and best practices in approach. We will work with Colleges and units on individualized planning around compensation, as necessary from a compliance perspective.
<p>Improve equitable treatment of women faculty and faculty of color in the workplace through expanded faculty and administration training, expansion of the Inclusive Excellence search committee training and monitoring progress through the Ohio State Culture survey.</p> <p><u>Senior Leader Partners</u> James Moore, ODI Susan Basso, OHR Alison Mincey, OHR Kay Wolf, OAA</p>	<p>See First Block (Left Column) on Page 1.</p> <p>Ongoing</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Revised culture surveys began Spring 2016 . • All faculty being offered exit interviews to identify themes related to separations. • A Carole Anderson faculty fellow will join OAA to review the "life cycle of a faculty member". Specifically, the fellow will examine faculty turnover. • Inclusive Excellence Search Committee Training continues to be implemented and expanded by ODI, TWP and OSU Advance
<p>Leverage the Flexible Work Policy as a benefit of working at Ohio State.</p> <p><u>Senior Leader Partners</u> Susan Basso, OHR Alison Mincey, OHR Kay Wolf, OAA</p>	<p>Ongoing</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Flexible Work Policy data is currently being collected campus-wide in OAA. OAA will collaborate with the Office of Human Resources on interpretation and any policy changes. Best practices will be published. • Faculty Resource Network will be discussing the Parental Leave, Flexible Work Policy and other work-life intersections in 2016-2017 year. • The Provost, in collaboration with applicable units and stakeholders, is reviewing the Parental Leave Policy for all faculty, Post-Docs, and students <p>Future</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • HR could recommunicate the flexible work policy

<p>Expand childcare offerings and provide more childcare alternatives to employees, such as Bright Horizons.</p> <p><u>Senior Leader Partners</u> Susan Basso, OHR</p>	<p>Current</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none">• OSU has one of the largest child care programs, offering childcare for over 425 children of faculty, staff and students.• Expanding care is a costly endeavor as it would require additional space and teaching and administrative staff.• HR would like to discuss whether negotiating for discounted rates with providers such as Bright Horizons would satisfy the PPCW request.
---	---