THE OHIO STATE UNIVERSITY

Subject:	President and Provost's Council on Women (PPCW) Final Report
Date:	July 13, 2015
From:	Joanne Turner, Chair FY16 Eunice Hornsby, Chair FY15
To:	President Michael Drake Provost Joseph Steinmetz

The PPCW's mission is "*advocating to the president and provost for the advancement of all women at The Ohio State University and providing leadership for the development of policies and practices that positively affect the working environment for women employed at The Ohio State University.*"

Each year, the Council is charged to examine and make recommendations on issues of concern. For the period of January 2014 – June 2015, the *original* charges were:

– **Bring Women to Ohio State** – in particular examining and recommending demonstrated improvements to search and selection practices/policies for all levels of faculty and staff.

– **Advance Women within Ohio State** – in particular identifying and recommending the roadblocks that women face and identifying best practices to support the progression, mentorship, and development of women and diverse faculty and staff.

– We ask that you **collaborate with the Provost and Chief Diversity Officer** on shaping the focus and charge of the Office of Diversity and Inclusion, including measurable outcomes that reflect our core diversity priorities and values.

In response to the charges of the President and Provost, and The Womens Place the PPCW established, or extended, five Task Forces:

– Widen the Circle (Chair: Holly Oakleaf)

– Best Practices for Search/Selection for faculty recruitment (Chair: Joanne Turner)

– Extending the PPCW collaboration with ODI (Chair: Maria Anderson)

– Glass breakers: Paths to Leadership (Chair: Lucy Ramos)

– Closing the Loop: revisiting the status of recommendations from PPCW (Chair: Wendy Smooth)

Executive Summary

Best Practices for Search/Selection for Faculty Recruitment

In response to the charge from the president and provost, the Best Practices for Search/Selection for Faculty Recruitment Task Force makes the following recommendations:

That the university develop:

1. A process and **reporting requirement** for departments/schools and colleges to evaluate faculty diversity within units, make comparisons with appropriate benchmarks, and report to the president and provost, with rewards for units that meet or exceed benchmarks and consequences for inaction and lack of progress.

2. A process to evaluate and encourage **innovative change** in unit culture regarding diversity and inclusion; emphasizing that change in leadership philosophy and practice can have significant impact.

3. The provision of **tools and training** to promote successful hires of diverse faculty.

The full report of the Best Practices for Search/Selection for Faculty Recruitment Task force is attached.

Widen the Circle

In response to the charge from the president and provost, and to support the recommendations of the Best Practices for Search/Selection for Faculty Recruitment Task Force, the Widen the Circle task force has generated/proposed to generate the following tools:

1. A**n interactive and live dashboard** that links and analyzes all department *diversity* was developed in FY15. The dashboard should be used to inform leader and manager evaluations and the budget process.

2. A**n interactive and live dashboard** will be created in the first half of FY16 that links and analyzes academic department diversity with *culture survey results*. The dashboard should inform leader and manager evaluations, planning, and the budget process.

The Widen the Circle Task Force recommends that:

1. **Guidelines be established** in data collection and reporting across campus.

2. **A common reporting tool** be established on a high functioning level that is easy to use across campus.

3. Information on demographics and the culture survey be **incorporated into the review of units** to identify areas for change.

4. Information presented in the dashboards be used for **addressing climate issues and retention** of faculty and staff with a goal of maintaining and enhancing diversity.

The full report of the Widen the Circle Task Force is attached.

The report for the Glass Breakers Task Force is attached.

The Extending the PPCW Collaboration With ODI Task Force was not convened, given resource constraints.

Proposed work for FY15-16

1. Complete the interactive and live dashboard and extend to include culture survey results.

2. Make recommendations for search and selection practices/policies for staff and senior leadership.

3. Make recommendations for how Ohio State can retain a diverse faculty pool.

4. Continue to highlight successful career paths of Ohio State women staff and faculty.

Report of the President and Provost's Council on Women
Widen the Circle Task Force

July 2015

Submitted to
President Michael Drake
Provost Joseph Steinmetz

Task Force members

Holly Oakleaf, Chair, Planning Research Analyst, Institutional Research and Planning
Jennifer Beard, Program Manager, The Women's Place
Jill Bystydzienski, Professor and Chair, Department of Women's Gender and Sexuality Studies
Diana Erchick, Professor, Mathematics Education, K-12, Newark Campus
Carole Fallon, Treasury Management Officer, Office of the Treasurer
Gloria Fleming, Associate Professor – Clinical and Physician, College of Ophthalmology
Elizabeth Hope, Division Coordinator, College of Public Health – Health Services Management and Policy
Allison Jones, Assistant Director, Career Management & Corporate Relations, Working Professional MBA
Program, Fisher College of Business Office of Career Management
Mary Menkedick-Ionno, Assistant Vice President and Associate General Counsel, Office of Legal Affairs
Vicki Pitstick, Program Manager, Second-Year Transformational Experience Program (STEP), Academic Affairs
Elizabeth (Lucy) Ramos, Communication & Marketing Manager, Office of Distance Education and eLearning
Valery Tarver, Director, Management Engineering and Process Improvement, Wexner Medical Center

Ohio State occupies an influential status among public and private Central Ohio employers and signed on early to support the Columbus Partnership's Widen the Circle Initiative, whose bold goal is to "make the Columbus Region the best place in the country for women to grow their careers."

The President and Provost's Council on Women's Widen the Circle Task Force was charged in 2014 to develop:

1. A process and reporting requirement for departments/schools and colleges to evaluate faculty diversity within units, make comparisons with appropriate benchmarks, and report to the president and provost, with rewards for units that meet or exceed benchmarks and consequences for inaction and lack of progress. To support this requirement, **an interactive and live dashboard** that links and analyzes all department *diversity* will be developed in FY15[1]. The dashboard should inform leader and manager evaluations and the budget process.

2. A process to evaluate and encourage **innovative** change in unit culture regarding diversity and inclusion; emphasizing that change in leadership philosophy and practice can have significant impact. To support this process, **an interactive and live dashboard** (created in FY15) that links and analyzes academic department diversity with *culture survey results* will be developed in the first half of FY16[2]. The dashboard should inform leader and manager evaluations, planning, and the budget process.

The Widen the Circle Task Force created two working groups to guide the process of establishing the needs and criteria for creating an interactive dashboard and selecting culture survey criteria that would overlay with the interactive dashboard.

---

[1] The Widen the Circle Task Force, in collaboration and with the support of Institutional Research and Planning, is currently working on the "diversity" dashboard, which will report by department, and roll up to the college, the diversity makeup of the department. It will be complete by May.

[2] The Widen the Circle Task Force, in collaboration and with the support of Institutional Research and Planning, is planning to add a "culture" dashboard, which will interface with the diversity dashboard, to report by department, and roll up to the college, the relationship of departmental culture and diversity makeup. It will be completed in FY 2016.

HISTORY AND INTRODUCTION

As a member of the Columbus Partnership, Ohio State became actively involved in the Central Ohio Widen the Circle Initiative at its outset. The Women's Place and PPCW were charged to lead the university's examination of where we were related to recruiting, hiring, and advancing women within Ohio State. Between 2012 and 2014, the PPCW examined the gender balance in the top Ohio State leadership positions (vice president, vice provost, dean) and examined the career paths of long-term women staff that had attained senior administrative and professional staff status. The study confirmed that there is a clear and pervasive lack of women and underrepresented groups at the top leadership ranks at Ohio State, and that there is much to learn from the career paths of women who have historically advanced at the university. The results of these studies can be found in the 2014 Widen the Circle Task Force Report.

After submitting our 2014 Widen the Circle report, the PPCW continued our work to identify best practices to support the advancement of women, as well as pathways for advancement of women at Ohio State. The 2015 Widen the Circle Task Force focused on data analysis and reporting, understanding that ready access to such data would enable leaders to assess the position and progress of their units in moving women forward at the university. As described below, the first priority was to create a dashboard to provide basic workforce data related to gender and ethnic diversity and the second priority will be to marry the workforce data with culture/workplace engagement and satisfaction data at the unit level.

Ohio State currently maintains human resource data within the human resource module of PeopleSoft and various "silo-ed" databases throughout campus. To maintain data integrity for creating an interactive dashboard, data will be used from the human resource module of PeopleSoft and official silo-ed data from human resource offices. Ohio State currently uses a limited interactive dash-boarding system called Oracle Business Intelligence Enterprise Edition. A secondary tool, Tableau (a free desktop reader of Tableau will be available to all users), is more appropriate for creating an interactive dashboard.

This year the Task Force has taken on an initiative to create tools instead of analyzing data. This project is more time-intensive than a basic analysis due to the technological needs and processes. Hence, it was determined that a two year project would be needed to finalize the interactive dashboard and potentially overlay the Culture Survey results.

PROCESS

Data maintained in PeopleSoft is not consistent across academic years nor departments and colleges. The steps required to create and maintain an interactive dashboard are:

1. Identify the elements (fields) desired for the dashboard

2. Identify data sources – PeopleSoft and human resource databases

3. Obtain data – data mining PeopleSoft and the human resource databases

4. Review the data for anomalies and differences

5. Align the data across years and identify missing elements

6. Structure the data into a useable format

7. Extract the data into Tableau

8. Design the dashboard*

9. After the dashboards are created they will need to be reviewed by the Office of Human Resources and departments for validation

10. Ongoing maintenance will be required to ensure data integrality and report updates

The steps required to merge Culture Survey questions to the interactive dashboard are:

1. Identify Culture Survey questions that relate to gender and ethnic diversity

2. Work with Institutional Research and Planning to review the list of questions selected from the Culture Survey for relevance

3. Work with Institutional Research and Planning to determine if the selected Culture Survey questions are significant to each department/unit/college

4. Merge the Culture Survey questions and significant values to the interactive dashboard

5. Have Institutional Research and Planning review the dashboard

NEXT STEPS

The second year iteration of the interactive dashboards will include feature requests from leadership and PeopleSoft data updates if data entry errors warrant correction.

In the next iteration the Task Force will work with Institutional Research and Planning to determine if the Culture Survey questions selected in this first year of the two year project are of statistical value to be added to the interactive dashboard.

We recommend that the Offices of Institutional Research and Planning in collaboration with Human Resources and Diversity and Inclusion lead the university to:

1. Establish data collection and reporting across campus;

2. Establish a common reporting tool on a high functioning level that is easy to use across campus (e.g. Tableau, SAS, OBIEE, etc.);

3. Incorporate information on demographics and the culture survey into the review of departments/units/colleges to identify areas for change; and

4. Present information in dashboard format to be used for addressing climate issues and retention of faculty and staff with a goal of maintaining and enhancing diversity.

CONCLUSIONS

We are optimistic that The Ohio State University can and will act on the relevant data presented within the interactive tool to make necessary changes to recruit and retain women and underrepresented minorities at Ohio State.

We recommend that the Widen the Circle Task Force continue in FY15-16, in collaboration with Institutional Research and Planning to fully establish the interactive and live dashboard as a tool to inform leader and manager evaluations, and to extend the dashboard to include culture survey data.

*In 2015 the Office of Institutional Research and Planning was approached by ODI to create a dashboard, similar to that being designed by the Widen the Circle task force. The Widen the Circle task force will work with the Office of Institutional Research and Planning to generate a combined dashboard that serves both needs. The dashboard will be maintained through the Office of Institutional Research and Planning.

Report of the President and Provost's Council on Women
Best Practices for Search/Selection for Faculty Recruitment Task Force

July 2015

Submitted to
President Michael Drake
Provost Joseph Steinmetz

Task Force members

Joanne Turner, Chair, Professor, Microbial Infection and Immunity, College of Medicine
Lisa Borelli, Co-Chair, Counselor, Ohio State Employee Assistance Program, Wexner Medical Center
David Burnette, Postdoctoral Researcher, College of Engineering
Victoria Dunn, Director of Leadership Initiatives for Woman of Color, Office of Diversity and Inclusion
Shannon Gonzales-Miller, Director of Minority Services, Office of Diversity and Inclusion
Katie Hall, Chief of Staff, Office of the President
Mary Juhas, Associate Vice President, Office of Research
Claire Kamp Dush, Associate Professor, Department of Human Sciences, College of Education and Human Ecology
Anne Marie LaBue, Vice President, Associate General Counsel, Cardinal Health
Kim Lambert, Talent Acquisition Consultant, Office of Human Resources
Susan Moffat-Bruce, Associate Professor, College of Medicine and Administrator, Wexner Medical Center
Hazel Morrow-Jones, Associate Provost for Women's Policy Initiatives and Director-The Women's Place, Office of Academic Affairs
Helen Patton, Chief Information Security Officer, Office of the Chief Information Officer
Robert Perry, Professor and Vice Chair, Physics, College of Arts and Sciences
Yael Vodovotz, Professor, College of Food, Agricultural, and Environmental Sciences

The President and Provost's Council on Women was charged in 2014 to:

– **Bring Women to Ohio State** – in particular examining and recommending demonstrated improvements to search and selection practices/policies for all levels of faculty and staff.

The Best Practices for Search/Selection Task Force was formed to develop recommendations to improve search and selection practices/policies for all levels of faculty and staff. During early Task Force meetings it was determined that the group should initially focus on faculty because tangible changes could be quickly implemented in collaboration with the Discovery Theme hires.

To facilitate change at the institutional level, the committee recommends that the president and provost implement:

1. A process and **reporting requirement** for departments/schools and colleges to evaluate faculty diversity within units, make comparisons with appropriate benchmarks, and report to the president and provost, with rewards for units that meet or exceed benchmarks/peers and consequences for inaction and lack of progress.

2. A process to evaluate and encourage **innovative change** in unit culture regarding diversity and inclusion; emphasizing that change in leadership philosophy and practice can have significant impact.

3. Provision of **tools and training** to promote successful hires of diverse faculty. The Search and Selection Task Force is collaborating with the Search Committee Action Team (SCAT) and Discovery Themes Initiative (DTI) to refine such tools and training.

Ohio State is committed to diversity and a campus climate of inclusion that is necessary for a rich learning environment. The PPCW **Best Practices for Search/Selection Task Force** recognizes the need to implement and celebrate the incremental steps in the process of diversifying university faculty to be more inclusive. Change cannot occur overnight, but implementation of recommendations will move us forward. While the PPCW represents an advisory committee specifically focused on gender identity and equality, we recognize that the recommendations herein are consistent with the mission to benefit all and our recommendations will also serve to promote diversity and inclusion of race/ethnicity, tribal/indigenous origins or descendancy, age, culture, generation, religion, class/caste, language, education, geography, nationality, disability, and sexual orientation. To facilitate change at the institutional level, the committee recommends that the president and provost:

RECOMMENDATIONS

1. **The Office of Human Resources, Office of Diversity and Inclusion, and Institutional Research and Planning should collaborate to implement a process and reporting requirement for departments/schools and colleges to evaluate faculty diversity within units, make comparisons with appropriate benchmarks, and report to the president and provost, with rewards for units that meet or exceed benchmarks/peers and consequences for inaction and lack of progress.**

Unit Diversity Reports

The Office of Diversity and Inclusion should lead the requirement that each department, school and college perform an annual diversity analysis report for each of their units that includes gender, race/ethnicity, tribal/indigenous origins or descendancy, age, culture, generation, religion, class/caste, language, education, geography, nationality, disability, and sexual orientation, as disclosed. The data should be benchmarked to the specific discipline at peer institutions and to the workforce in Columbus or Central Ohio. The report should contain narrative describing unit diversity goals (see *Unit Diversity Benchmarks*) and documented successes with broadening faculty diversity. The report should clearly outline the increase/decrease in diverse faculty over time in each unit; describe any roadblocks to broadening the unit faculty diversity, and outline future opportunities to change the unit demographics (upcoming hires, etc.).

The report and narrative should be submitted to the dean of the unit and the provost, and shared with the Office of Diversity and Inclusion, PPCW, Senate Diversity Committee, Council of Deans, and made publicly available.

To support the requirement for an annual Unit Diversity Report, an interactive and live dashboard has been developed by the PPCW Widen the Circle Task Force in conjunction with the Office of Institutional Research and Planning. The dashboard links and analyzes academic department diversity. The dashboard should be available to all units, with training provided in its use, and should serve to inform leader and manager evaluations and the budget process.

Unit Diversity Benchmarks

Benchmarks should be developed and reviewed/updated annually for each department, school and college by the unit diversity officer (if applicable) and/or in conjunction with the Office of Human Resources and Institutional Research and Planning. The benchmarks will recognize discipline specific and population benchmarks. Expectations are that units numbers should be equivalent to or exceed benchmarks, when possible, of those in the same discipline of peer institutions. An external review of each unit's metrics (performed by ODI) should be performed to provide an outside perspective and any discrepancies will be addressed. Department, school and college strategic plans should include a diversity statement and goal.

Rewarding success and promoting action

Unit diversity and generation of an annual unit diversity report to understand unit profiles and goals, should be a priority element of dean and chair annual reviews. Units that show evidence of forward progress (moving in the right direction) or that meet or exceed diversity benchmarks should be recognized and rewarded, and their methods (best practices) shared with other units. Rewards could include recognition by the president and provost, positive annual review outcome for the dean or chair that could be reflected in an annual salary increase and/or

bonus, and additional funds to the unit to support further diversity hiring/programming or in the form of discretionary funds.

Units that fail to meet their targets due to <u>inaction</u> should incur consequences. These could include a negative annual review outcome for the dean or chair with potential for a reduced annual salary increase and/or bonus. A hiring freeze should be implemented until the unit has participated in diversity training and developed a plan for change. A continued failure to prioritize unit diversity could result in a change of leadership or added resources to specifically support leader growth in the area of diversity. Note that inaction refers to units that have/had an open faculty search and failed to attract a diverse candidate pool or failed to justify the absence of a diverse candidate in the final selections.

2. **The Office of Diversity and Inclusion and The Women's Place should collaborate to implement a process to evaluate and encourage innovative change in unit culture regarding diversity and inclusion, emphasizing that change in leadership philosophy and practice can have significant impact.**

The unit head has enormous influence on the culture of a unit. Training of the unit head, and/or dean can be an effective way to implement change, including transparency and inclusive processes for hiring. Furthermore, a critical mass of faculty and staff that are dedicated to broadening unit diversity will facilitate change. The following processes are recommended.

Unit Head Diversity Training

Evaluate the White Men's Caucus (wmfdp.com/) as experienced by senior leadership and support senior leaders who decide to extend this experience to others in their units.

Extend the diversity training and tools in the new chair onboarding process developed by OAA/HR (hr.osu.edu/ole/departmentchairresources).

Unit Faculty Diversity Training

Recommend that at least 25% of all unit faculty attend a diversity experience program. This may include in-house training at Ohio State, the White Men & Allies program (wmfdp.com/) or Advocates and Allies (ndsu.edu/forward/advance_forward_initiatives/forward_advocates_and_allies/), for example, as experiential learning tools to increase the number of unit faculty that are open to discussions on diversity, and to implementing change.

Increase Unit Diversity Awareness

A university culture analysis should be performed every 3 years for each unit and shared with the unit head, dean and provost. To support this process, an interactive and live dashboard that links and analyzes academic department diversity with *culture survey results* will be developed in the first half of FY16[3] by the Widen the Circle Task Force and Institutional Research and Planning. The dashboard should inform leader and manager evaluations, planning, and the budget process. The unit head should be expected to share the results with faculty and staff.

We recommend developing an online module or extending components of the Discovery Themes Initiative (DTI) presentations to all units to articulate why a diverse workforce has value (e.g., role models for students, success of diverse units, positive effects on diverse student body, greater access to talent, use of many viewpoints can help achieve best solutions and can increase creativity and new solutions), and to provide a resource of best practices for search committee training and faculty retention.

All unit faculty and staff should take an online module on diversity and inclusion every year, which can be facilitated by the inclusion of a module in the computer-based learning (cbl) online training requirements or through BuckeyeLearn.

---

[3] The Widen the Circle Task Force, in collaboration and with the support of Institutional Research and Planning, is planning to add a "culture" dashboard, which will interface with the diversity dashboard, to report by department, and roll up to the college, the relationship of departmental culture and diversity makeup. It will be completed in FY 2016.

3. **The Office of Human Resources should assume leadership to provide tools and training to promote successful hires of diverse faculty.**

The hiring of a diverse faculty can be enhanced and facilitated by the provision of tools and training to unit heads, search committee chairs and members, and individual faculty and staff. The unit culture also needs to be welcoming and supportive to retain diverse faculty.

All search committee chairs and members should have formal documented search committee training prior to the initiation of a search. This can be achieved by expanding the DTI training program to all university faculty search committee members. Expanding the DTI training will require a financial investment from the president and provost, including financial rewards or release time for trainers.

Search committee members should be required to take implicit association tests prior to the initiation of the search (implicit.harvard.edu/implicit/). Required/recommended tests include gender-career (required), gender-science (required), race (required), sexuality (recommended), and disability (recommended).

Hiring units should discuss what diversity means to them before the initiation of a search. The search committee should refer to their unit's annual diversity analysis and benchmarks and discuss them with the unit head prior to a search in order to recognize the needs/gaps. Search committees should include an external member (from a different college) that has also received diversity and inclusion training.

A toolkit should be generated to facilitate search committee processes. The toolkit should grow from an expansion of the DTI website to include information for all departments, schools and colleges; this information will serve as a base for unit HR personnel. The toolkit should be a *base* information packet on Central Ohio and Ohio State diversity, communities, resources, etc., to which units can add to and not delete from, and should be provided to all job applicants. The development and maintenance of a university-wide toolkit will require a financial investment from the president and provost to ensure that the website is accurately curated and updated. The toolkit should include information on how to write a position description that attracts a diverse pool (specific language, where to post, etc.); how to develop a targeted hiring plan; how to run an effective, unbiased candidate search and selection process; how to host candidate interviews; and how to evaluate and select priority candidates in a non-biased way.

CONCLUSIONS

The recommendations outlined by the Best Practices in Search and Selection committee echo recommendations made previously by PPCW, and other offices. We are optimistic that Ohio State can and will act on the recommendations to make necessary changes to recruit and retain women and underrepresented minorities at the university.

We recommend that the PPCW continue in FY15-16 to make recommendations for search and selection practices/policies for staff and senior leadership. We further recommend that the PPCW evaluate and make recommendations for how Ohio State can retain a diverse faculty pool.

The three recommendations of the Best Practices in Search and Selection committee were developed in conjunction with The Women's Place, Office of Research, and Office of Diversity and Inclusion through current committee membership. Recommendation two was coordinated with The Women's Place who also supported the attendance of Joanne Turner at the White Men for Full Diversity Learning Lab. Recommendation three was coordinated with the Search Committee Action Team (SCAT) and DTI members, and included the participation of committee members on the DTI committee and also serving as DTI trainers.

Report of the President and Provost's Council on Women
Glass Breakers: Paths to Leadership

July 2015

Task Force Members

Lucy Ramos (Chair), Program Director of Marketing and Communications, OCIO Customer Experience
Molly Driscoll, Learning and Development, Office of Human Resources
Diane Florian, Communications coordinator, The Women's Place, Office of Academic Affairs
Mary Menkedick Ionno, Assistant Vice President and Associate General Counsel, Office of Legal Affairs
Karen Patterson, Assistant Vice President, University Communications, Office of University Advancement

Ohio State's culture survey responses have illustrated that women staff often lack a well-defined career path. We believed that "you can't be what you can't see," and set out to shine a spotlight on how successful women found their way into their leadership roles at Ohio State. Ten feature stories on women leaders were developed and shared on the PPCW's website. These unique stories from staff leaders across the university offered valuable insights for women looking to make their own mark on the world.
ppcw.osu.edu/spotlight